

NUTRITION

Analysis of nutrition interventions within India's policy framework



Cost-Benefit Analysis

AUTHORS: **William Joe**
Assistant Professor
Institute of Economic Growth,
Delhi

Abhishek Kumar
Research Scholar
Central University of Gujarat,
Gandhinagar

S.V. Subramanian
H Professor of Population Health
and Geography, Department of
Social and Behavioral Sciences,
Harvard TH Chan School of
Public Health

© 2018 Copenhagen Consensus Center

info@copenhagenconsensus.com

www.copenhagenconsensus.com

This work has been produced as a part of the Andhra Pradesh Priorities project under the larger, India Consensus project.

This project is undertaken in partnership with Tata Trusts.

TATA TRUSTS

Some rights reserved



This work is available under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International license ([CC BY 4.0](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)). Under the Creative Commons Attribution license, you are free to copy, distribute, transmit, and adapt this work, including for commercial purposes, under the following conditions:

Attribution

Please cite the work as follows: #AUTHOR NAME#, #PAPER TITLE#, Andhra Pradesh Priorities, Copenhagen Consensus Center, 2017. License: Creative Commons Attribution CC BY 4.0.

Third-party content

Copenhagen Consensus Center does not necessarily own each component of the content contained within the work. If you wish to re-use a component of the work, it is your responsibility to determine whether permission is needed for that re-use and to obtain permission from the copyright owner. Examples of components can include, but are not limited to, tables, figures, or images.

Analysis of nutrition interventions within India's policy framework

Andhra Pradesh Priorities An India Consensus Prioritization Project

William Joe

Assistant Professor
Institute of Economic Growth, Delhi

Abhishek Kumar

Research Scholar
Central University of Gujarat, Gandhinagar

S.V. Subramanian

Professor of Population Health and Geography
Department of Social and Behavioral Sciences
Harvard TH Chan School of Public Health

Working paper as of April 27, 2018

ACADEMIC ABSTRACT	1
POLICY ABSTRACT	2
DIRECT NUTRITION BASED INTERVENTIONS	2
INTERPERSONAL COUNSELLING FOR BEHAVIOUR CHANGE	3
SUPPLEMENTARY FOOD FOR MOTHER AND CHILD	3
MICRONUTRIENT SUPPLEMENTATION FOR PREGNANT WOMEN DURING ANC VISITS	5
COMMUNITY BASED TREATMENT OF CHILDREN WITH SAM USING READY-TO-USE-THERAPUTIC FOODS (RUTF).....	6
THE PROBLEM.....	7
OVERVIEW: PENETRATION, PREVENTION WITH INTERVENTION.....	7
IMPLEMENTATION CONSIDERATIONS	8
COSTS AND BENEFITS.....	8
ACRONYMS.....	10
INTRODUCTION	11
PROPOSED INTERVENTION BACKGROUND	13
BACKGROUND AND EVIDENCE OF INTERVENTIONS	13
DESCRIPTION OF INTERVENTIONS	15
CALCULATION OF COSTS AND BENEFITS	17
METHODOLOGY.....	18
METHODOLOGY: OVERALL, PROMOTION AND PROVISION PACKAGE	18
METHODOLOGY: MICRONUTRIENT SUPPLEMENTATION FOR PREGNANT WOMEN DURING ANC VISITS.....	19
METHODOLOGY: COMMUNITY BASED TREATMENT OF CHILDREN WITH SAM USING RUTF (CMAM)	20
INTERVENTION EFFECTIVENESS AND CALCULATION OF HEALTH EFFECTS	21
COMMON APPROACH.....	23
RESULTS.....	24
CONCLUSION	27
REFERENCES.....	29
APPENDIX	34

Academic Abstract

Over the last few years, the economy of Andhra Pradesh has grown at a tremendous pace, but in a stark contradiction, severe malnutrition still affects a large proportion of its population. With 60 per cent of the women in the age group 15-49 years being anaemic and a high percentage of children under 5 years of age being stunted (NFHS-4), the provision of essential health and nutrition inputs becomes a topmost priority. The Union and the State Governments in India have launched various nutrition and health programmes (such as ICDS and NHM) to reduce the burden of undernutrition. Recently, Andhra Pradesh government launched the Nutrition Mission to improve the food intake of mother and child during the first 1,000 days of life. But, low coverage of nutrition-based interventions for children persists as a major concern (Mani. et. al., 2017). This study attempts to estimate the costs and benefits accruing from increasing the coverage of preventive and promotional interventions in Andhra Pradesh. The benefits are measured in terms of the number of years of life saved due to decline in child mortality and valued at 3 times the value of GDP/capita. Benefits also include the value of avoiding a brief period of life spent living with the disability arising from nutrition-related illness. Five alternate scenarios have been created on the basis of specific nutrition based interventions which include a) counselling for behaviour change, b) supplementary food, c) micronutrient supplements, d) community based treatment of Severe Acute Malnutrition (SAM) and e) an overall package consisting of all interventions except SAM. Estimated benefits for Andhra Pradesh from the overall package at 3 times the value of per capita SDP and discounted at 5 per cent are Rs. 120,824 and estimated costs are approximately Rs. 12,885 per beneficiary, resulting in a benefit/cost ratio of approximately 9. The benefit/cost ratios estimated at 3 per cent and 8 per cent discount rate are 19 and 4 respectively. Similar analysis is performed for other four scenarios. To conclude, we observe substantial benefits from delivery of these nutrition-related interventions. Although, we have used national cost estimates as the sub-national data is unable but the variation in results is expected to be smaller.

Policy Abstract

Direct nutrition based interventions

- **Problem:** In Andhra Pradesh 31 percent of children below five years are stunted and 32 percent are under-weight. 60 percent women in reproductive age group are anaemic (NFHS-4). Such nutritional deficiencies adversely affect the health of the mothers and the children.
- **Intervention:** Direct nutrition-based interventions include counselling for behaviour change, supplementary food and micronutrient supplements.
- **Overview:** The Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (MHFW) and the Ministry of Women and Child Development (MWCD) are the major nodal agencies involved in implementing the nutrition-based interventions present in India's policy framework. (Avula et al. 2013). These interventions are agreed upon by a large number of stakeholders including Coalition for Food and Nutrition Security in India (Swaminathan 2009). Bhutta et. al (2008) present a comprehensive overview of these interventions and the effects.
- **Implementation Considerations:** The demographic and socio-economic conditions at sub-national level might require a tailored approach. Although, the coverage for nutrition interventions for mothers is high, the effectiveness is questionable.
- **Costs and Benefits**
 - **Costs:** Cost of interventions related to provision of supplementary food and micronutrients which are primarily delivered through the government health programmes have been considered. Cost per beneficiary is Rs.12,885 and for a 10 per cent increase in coverage the cost is Rs 140 crore. 53 per cent of the cost is the value of caregiver time and the rest are financial outlays by the state
 - **Benefits:** The primary beneficiaries are pregnant women and lactating mothers and children up to 5 years of age. The benefits will be realized in terms of sizeable reduction in terms of YLLS and YLDs as well as stunting. A 10 per cent increase in coverage would avoid, 181 deaths, and reduce stunting by 20% in the population receiving the intervention. Benefits

realized per beneficiary are Rs.120,824, 89 per cent of which represent improved lifetime productivity from avoided stunting. Total benefits for a 10 per cent increase in coverage are Rs. 1,171 crore.

Interpersonal counselling for behaviour change

- **Problem:** Diarrhoea is a major cause of deaths among children under 5 years of age in Andhra Pradesh. Low socioeconomic status, poor maternal literacy, inadequate breastfeeding, malnutrition, poor sanitation and hygiene practices of the mother or the care taker are the major determinants of diarrheal diseases.
- **Intervention:** Interpersonal counselling for behaviour change
- **Overview:** A six-year intervention (2016-2021) which include counselling for breastfeeding and counselling for complementary feeding and hand washing will help in avoiding 240 deaths in Andhra Pradesh which are related to diarrhoea.
- **Implementation Considerations:** Community workers are overburdened and lack of supervision for effective implementation of the IEC activities could lower the potential coverage of the intervention (Jacob, 2011).
- **Costs and Benefits:**
 - **Costs:** Major proportion of cost which is Rs.486 will be incurred on providing complementary feeding and hand washing education (6–12 months of age). Cost per beneficiary is Rs. 1117 cost for increasing coverage by 10 per cent is Rs. 13 crore.
 - **Benefits:** A total of 107 YLLS and 73 YLDs will be avoided for a 10 per cent increase in coverage. The major beneficiaries are the children under 5 years of age who will benefit because of sizeable reduction in diarrhoea. Stunting will be reduced by 12% in the beneficiary population. Benefits realized per beneficiary is Rs. 71,423, 89 per cent of which represent improved lifetime productivity from avoided stunting. Total benefits for a 10 per cent increase in coverage are Rs. 775 crore.

Supplementary food for mother and child

- **Problem:** The health status of a child is inextricably linked to the health status of the mother. Women who are anaemic are likely to deliver low birth weight

babies, who are likely to remain anaemic and suffer from cumulative growth and development deficit. Adequate nutritional health is critical for safe motherhood and to break the otherwise perpetual intergenerational cycle of under-nutrition. In India, there is very high prevalence of both maternal and child under-nutrition.

- **Intervention:** Supplementary food for mother and child.
- **Overview:** All children below 6 years of age, pregnant women and lactating mothers are eligible for availing of supplementary food services under the Integrated Child Development Scheme (ICDS) which is funded by both Central and State government.
- **Implementation Considerations:** Supplementary nutrition needs to be better targeted towards those sections that actually require the appropriate nutrition. The policy makers need to clearly frame rules for admission, quality assurance and accountability so that there are no distortions (Sharma, 2017).
- **Costs and Benefits**
 - **Costs:** Costs include provision of complementary food supplements to children aged 6-12 (Rs. 985) and 12-36 months (Rs.1970) and pregnant and lactating women (Rs.1149)¹. Marginal cost of mother's time for these activities is Rs.6962. Cost per beneficiary is Rs.10,341 and a ten per cent increase in coverage would cost 112 crore.
 - **Benefits:** The primary beneficiaries are children aged 6-12 and 12-36 months and pregnant and lactating women. The benefits will accrue through reduction in deaths and morbidity from specific diseases due to provision of improved nutrition. It is estimated that 161 lives will be saved for a ten per cent increase in coverage. Stunting will be reduced by 18% in the population receiving the intervention. Benefits realized per beneficiary are Rs. 107,135, 89 per cent of which represent improved lifetime productivity from avoided stunting. Total benefits for a 10 per cent increase in coverage are Rs. 1,162 crore.

¹ Figure in parenthesis are unit costs.

Micronutrient supplementation for pregnant women during ANC visits

- **Problem:** Although micronutrients are required in small amounts for optimal health and development, their absence in diet could lead to susceptibility to infections. Their interacting effects on health, growth and immunocompetence cannot be ignored. The micronutrient deficiencies of vitamin A, iron, iodine, calcium, zinc and folic acid are common among women and children (MWCD, 2012).
- **Intervention:** Micronutrient supplementation for pregnant women during ANC visits.
- **Overview:** The interventions which focus on providing iron, iodine, calcium, zinc and ORS are included in the NHM RMNCH+ A programme. The intervention aims at reducing maternal anaemia, reduce the risk of preterm births and low birth weights.
- **Implementation Considerations:** The prevalence of micronutrient deficiencies is widespread in India especially among preschool children and women in the reproductive age group. Although schemes are in place, but shortage of health workers imply lower compliance rates of government interventions (Sharma, 2017).
- **Costs and Benefits**
 - **Costs:** The total cost of this intervention in Andhra Pradesh for one year is 88 crore rupees and includes the cost of health workers, training of the workers and provision of the supplements. Cost per beneficiary is Rs. 884, all of which are financial outlays.
 - **Benefits:** The benefits estimated from this intervention are Rs. 3542 crore. There are a multitude of impacts from the intervention: 106,882 cases of maternal anemia avoided, 25,293 avoided LBW babies, 113 avoided maternal deaths, 19,103 avoided preterm births, 1,337 avoided preterm deaths and 210 avoided still births. Benefits realized per beneficiary is Rs.34,678.

Community Based Treatment of children with SAM using Ready-to-use-therapeutic foods (RUTF)

- **Problem:** The percentage of wasted children in Andhra Pradesh has increased to 17 per cent (NFHS-4, 2015-16) from 14 per cent in NFHS-3, 2005-06. Children with weak nutritional base are more likely to experience growth failure and probably pass it on to the next generation. This intergenerational cycle of under-nutrition adversely affects certain segments of population, particularly from lower socio-economic status.
- **Intervention:** Treatment of children with Severe Acute Malnutrition (SAM). Given this would be a new program, the intervention assumes 50% treatment of wasted children throughout the state.
- **Overview:** Children with Severe Acute Malnutrition (SAM) have nine times higher risk of dying than well-nourished children (GOI). There is no current systematic implementation of community based management of SAM in India. This intervention proposes scale up of SAM screening by ASHA workers and implementation of community based management of SAM using RUTF or local-based nutritionally equivalent therapeutic foods. Special focus is given on timely, adequate and appropriate feeding for children.
- **Implementation Considerations:** This would be a new program for the state, so implementation success is conditional on proper training of health workers to achieve the desired goals, proper funding, sound management and continued communication with beneficiaries. The health structure is already in shambles (Sharma, 2017).
- **Costs and Benefits**
 - **Costs:** Major components include cost of provision of RUTF for children suffering from SAM, total personnel and training cost and cost incurred by households on treatment visits. Cost per beneficiary is Rs. 8829 (range Rs 5,287-Rs 12,371).
 - **Benefits:** 424 to 664 avoided deaths and 749 to 1175 avoided YLDs per year from treated SAM. Benefits realized per child treated range from Rs. 25,330 to Rs 39,716.

The Problem

In Andhra Pradesh, the prevalence of stunting and wasting are 31 per cent and 17 per cent respectively. As per the National Family Health Survey-4 report (2015-16), the rate of wasting has increased between 2006 and 2016. The prevalence of malnutrition-related illness persists as a major public health concern and the distribution of nutritional deprivations is highly skewed across districts. Health of the population is an important determinant economic growth. A large proportion of population with poor health status can reduce the economic potential as they are less likely to perform to their highest capabilities. The health of a child is highly correlated with the health status of her mother. In Andhra Pradesh, sixty per cent of women in age group 15-49 are anaemic and that further affects the nutritional health of the children. Other determinants of health include social, economic, dietary, lifestyle, environmental, locational, institutional, and health awareness. The foundations laid during the early years of life are perhaps the most important determinant of health. In India, nearly half of children under five years of age die each year due to poor nutrition (Bhandari and Sinha, 2015), the variation across states could be much severe. Income is an enabling factor as those mired in poverty find it difficult to afford a healthy diet.

Although, the Union and the State Governments are consistently working towards reducing the prevalence of malnutrition in the country and have implemented several schemes/programmes under different Ministries/Departments through State Governments/UT Administrations, the success has been modest. Lack of a comprehensive approach which appreciates the nature of challenges according to the local settings along with improvement in governance will be instrumental in overcoming the challenge. Furthermore, the public health interventions for specially designed for vulnerable groups need to be strengthened with focus on socio-economic determinants (MWCD, 2012).

Overview: penetration, prevention with intervention

Although, Andhra Pradesh performs better when the stunting and wasting figures are compared with national average, the health outcomes can be further improved. The future base of human resources is susceptible to under-nutrition which affects not only their survival but also the course of economic development. Essential health and nutrition inputs reach only less than 55 per cent of mothers and children and the consequences of poor

nutrition manifest in terms of growth failure of child, reduced learning capacity, increased rate of morbidity and mortality. The Government of India has in place nutrition and health programmes (ICDS and NHM) and Andhra Pradesh has also taken the initiative by launching the Nutrition Mission. Besides, most of the nutrition related diseases could be avoided by simply scaling up these interventions.

Implementation Considerations

The progress of most of the health and nutrition programmes has been slow. The target group, for instance, of ICDS programme is mostly children after the age of three when malnutrition has already set in (Awofeso and Rammohan, 2011). Similarly, the focus on improving mothers' feeding and caring behaviour with emphasis on infant and young child feeding and maternal nutrition during pregnancy and lactation has not been much effective. Policymakers need to identify the vulnerable groups, who are in dire need of these benefits. Second step should be to further strengthen the referral to the health system to prevent diseases which could easily be avoided, particularly in rural areas where the prevalence of under-nutrition is higher. Also, the key lies in involving communities in the implementation and monitoring of these interventions as the community health workers either suffer due to lack of support or are overburdened with multiple activities.

Costs and Benefits

The overall intervention is expected to reduce the prevalence of both severe and moderate stunting by 20 per cent to 8.5 per cent and 16.5 per cent, respectively in Andhra Pradesh. The results for both the scenario presented in tables below are expected to yield sizeable benefits.

Table 1: Results Scenario 1 (primary analysis – years of life saved valued at 3x GSDP per capita)

Interventions	Benefit	Cost	BCR
Direct nutrition based interventions	120,824	12,885	9
Interpersonal counselling for behaviour change	71,423	1,177	61
Supplementary food for mother and child	107,135	10,341	10
Micronutrient supplementation for pregnant women during ANC visits	34,678	884	39
Community based treatment of SAM using RUTF (median)	32,523	8829	4

Table 2: Results Scenario 2 (sensitivity analysis – lives saved valued at VSL)

Interventions	Benefit	Cost	BCR
Direct nutrition based interventions	119,606	12,885	9
Interpersonal counselling for behaviour change	70,703	1,177	60
Supplementary food for mother and child	106,054	10,341	10
Micronutrient supplementation for pregnant women during ANC visits	36,851	884	42
Community based treatment of SAM using RUTF (median)	45,452	8829	5

All costs and benefits are in Rs per beneficiary, and assumes 5% discount rate

Acronyms

CMAM – Community Based Management of Acute Malnutrition

DALY – Disability-Adjusted Life Year

ICDS - Integrated Child Development Services

IDA – Iron Deficiency Anaemia

LBW – Low Birth Weight

MAM – Moderate Acute Malnutrition ($-3 \leq \text{WHZ} < -2$)

NRHM - National Rural Health Mission

NFHS - National Family Health Survey

RUTF – Ready-to-Use Therapeutic Food

SAM – Severe Acute Malnutrition ($\text{WHZ} < -3$)

WHZ -- Weight-for-Height Z-score

YLD – Years Lost Due to Disability

YLL – Years of Life Lost

Introduction

India is the home of largest number of undernourished children in the world (World Bank 2005). In 2005–06, nearly half of all children under 5 years of age in India were stunted and 43 per cent were underweight (International Institute for Population Sciences 2007). Although recently released NFHS-4 reports a decline in under-nutrition (35.7 per cent) and stunting (38.4 per cent), the proportion of children who exhibit wasting has increased over time (from 20 per cent to 21 per cent). There are marked differentials in proportion of underweight children across rural and urban areas and across different states. The percentage of children found to be underweight is higher in rural areas (38 per cent) as compared to urban areas (29 per cent) GOI (2013). The incidence of low birth-weight babies also varies across different states with Andhra Pradesh witnessing a high number of underweight childbirths at 18.4 per cent GOI (2013). Also, anaemia among women is a big issue in Andhra Pradesh. This state of affairs is completely unacceptable given the fact that decades of policymaking and resources are devoted to curb under-nutrition. It is true that India's nutritional status is gradually improving because of improvements in socio-economic factors, availability of portable water and the infrastructure like health facilities. But the dietary intake and dietary diversity continues to be a major concern. Malnutrition is an aggravating factor behind prevalence of numerous diseases such as diarrhoea, respiratory infections, and measles. Lack of nutrition can undermine the immune system. Malnutrition could dent the growth potential of an economy as there are significant cognitive and productivity costs associated with inadequate nutrition. Given that India has the highest number of deaths among children younger than 5 years of age globally, and majority of them are preventable, an effective policy focussing on nutrition can lead to higher growth rate by increasing the stock of human capital (MWCD, 2012).

Nutrition diversity is one of the main predictors of child stunting and underweight (Corsi et al., 2016). It is well documented that nutrition-based interventions could improve the health of mother and children, reduce the number of deaths and accelerate the progress in achieving the targets set for health outcomes (Bhutta et al., 2013; Bhutta et al., 2008; Horton et al., 2010). At present India has two major national programs which aim at improving the nutrition status of maternal and child health: Integrated Child Development Scheme (ICDS)

implemented by the Ministry of Women and Child Development, and National Rural Health Mission (NRM) implemented by the Ministry of Health and Family Welfare. The programs have the potential to cater to the needs of all sections of the society and include all the nutrition interventions which are targeted at solving the deficiency of essential nutrients. The ICDS scheme was launched much prior to NHM in 1975 to improve the health and nutrition needs of children under age 6. As part of universalization, in 2004, the scheme was expanded to cover all the regions of the country. ICDS include a number of interventions, including which provide supplementary food, facilitate for immunization, health check-ups and referral services for both mother and child. Preschool non-formal education is also provided for children aged three to six years. However, administrative hassles in implementation, lack of adequate infrastructure, poor coverage and poor quality of food are some of the disappointments which undermine the efforts of the government. NHM reflects the renewed focus of the government's persistence to combat the nutritional challenges facing the country. The NRHM was launched in 2005 in 18 states with poor infrastructure and low public health indicators to strengthen state health systems, with a special focus on reproductive and child health services and disease control programs. The interventions included in NHM deal directly with the direct causes of maternal and infant mortality. The working of the programs is synchronized to a great extent with NRHM operating in collaboration with the existing health and ICDS infrastructure. The increase in staff and improved health infrastructure with commencement of NRHM has provided a much-needed booster to improve maternal and child health and their nutritional outcome. The nutrition interventions covered in this study, except for community based management of SAM, are present in both of these programs.

Currently there is no large scale implementation of community based management of SAM using RUTF in Andhra Pradesh, or pan-India. Instead, facility-based treatment at Malnutrition Treatment Centers or Nutrition Rehabilitation Centers are the norm. In December 2015, the government of Rajasthan initiated a program – called POSHAN – to pilot a large scale CMAM initiative across 13 districts of the state (CIFF, 2018). The program screened 230,000 and treated about 9000 children for SAM with high recovery rates (Government of Rajasthan, 2018). In 2017 the program was expanded to cover 20 districts. POSHAN demonstrates that it

is possible to leverage existing healthcare infrastructure and staff, particularly ASHAs and ANMs, to deliver a CMAM program at scale in a government led initiative.

Although identification of gaps and implementation and monitoring of intervention strategies is itself a challenge, the other crucial factor is the cost of financing the intervention and the extent of successful co-ordination between the two programs in a manner such that the meagre budget in the health sector is utilized efficiently. The focus of this study will be to estimate the cost of the nutrition-based interventions in India and the benefits received in terms of improved health outcomes.

Proposed Intervention Background

Background and Evidence of Interventions

India's policy framework now contains nutrition interventions which are targeted at improving the status of maternal and child under-nutrition. Realizing that the period starting from the moment a woman is conceived to first 24 months of the age of the child is crucial for future development, these interventions aim at providing an environment conducive for their growth. The most influential work which has led to this policy framework includes the Lancet Series on Maternal and Child Undernutrition (Bhutta et al. 2008) and the Coalition for Sustainable Nutrition Security in India (2010). The nutritional interventions in India cover a variety of interventions for pregnant and lactating mothers and children aged 5 years ranging from nutritional supplements, food fortification, deworming, IFA and vitamin A prophylactic doses pills to and awareness creation. For the purpose of our analysis these interventions have been categorized depending on whether they are targeted at promoting the benefits of the intervention, providing supplements, micronutrients or treatment of severe acute malnutrition. The evidences related to efficacy of these interventions have been studied in detail by Bhutta et. al. (2008, 2013). They provide the estimates related with reduction in risk of major disease outcomes by doing a meta-analysis of existing studies on interventions affecting maternal and child undernutrition. They also model the effect of a package of nutrition direct interventions on a variety of health outcomes in 36 countries where 90 per cent of the children suffer from stunted linear growth, particularly infant and child mortality, as well as low birth weight and stunting. Since the authors are analysing the effect of the interventions on stunting, the specific evidences available from their study here are

discussed. Complementary feeding support and educational strategies have been observed to significantly impact the growth of children. Promotion of hand washing education and its benefits is instrumental in reducing the prevalence of diarrhoea by 30 per cent. This in turn leads to a reduction in the odds of stunting. Systematic review shows that the odds of stunting increase by 4 per cent with each episode of diarrhoea. (Bhutta et. al. 2008).

The deficiency of Vitamin A definitely is a cause of stunting but administering the supplementation does not seem to lower the prevalence of stunting. However, the effect of Vitamin A supplementation has been found to be significant on mortality. Zinc supplement has been observed to reduce stunting and mortality directly from 6 months onwards. The reduction in odds of stunting is as high as 15 per cent in each age group. The modelling exercise for estimating the effect of nutrition-related interventions on mortality and stunting shows that 99 per cent coverage with feeding interventions (promotion of complementary feeding and other supportive strategies) leads to relative risk reduction in stunting by 19.8 per cent at 12 months, 17.2 per cent at 24 months and 15 per cent at 36 months. The effect of zinc intervention has been found to be significant with a relative reduction of 9.1 per cent at 12 months, 15.5 per cent at 24 months and 17 per cent at 36 months. The effectiveness of multiple micronutrients during pregnancy and hygiene-based interventions has been found to be very low somewhere in the range of 1-2.5 per cent. It seems the complete package consisting of general nutrition strategies is quite effective with relative risk reduction being 21.7 per cent at 12 months, 17.8 per cent at 24 months and 15.5 per cent at 36 months. An intervention consisting of micronutrients leads to a 17.4 percent relative reduction in prevalence of stunting. The effect of deworming and iron supplements on stunting are negligible therefore no attempt was undertaken to model their effectiveness. Although the effect of Vitamin A, iron and deworming has been negligible but it is well documented that their deficiency could lead to a weak immune system which could lead to increased risk of infections and stunting (Caulfield et. al. 2006; Branca et. al. 2002; Reinhardt 2014).

The focus on evidence-based nutrition strategies in India assumes added significance because recently released NFHS-4 reports a decline in undernutrition and stunting, but the proportion of children who exhibit wasting has increased over time. In case of Andhra Pradesh making the comparison on the basis of NFHS might not be helpful as the boundaries of the state have changed. But, the state has fared poorly on many health outcomes with variation across

regions (Boone et. al., 2017). The economic cost and benefit to be reaped are significant. There are a number of social and economic consequences of stunting which are well documented in literature. Stunting could lead to decrease in cognitive development, lower school performance and therefore lower the productivity potential during adulthood. For instance, Behrman, Alderman and Hoddinott (2004) estimate a decline in average income by 2.2 per cent for individuals born with low birth weight on account of stunting. On similar lines, Hoddinott et. al. (2008,2011) studied the effect of nutrition intervention during early childhood on economic productivity in Guatemalan adults and found that the prevalence of stunting was 25 per cent lower among the cohort which was provided the supplementation. They report that stunting caused a difference of 46 per cent in wages and 66 per cent in consumption. Halim et. al. (2015) have done a review of the literature about economic consequences of maternal and early childhood interventions in low and middle income country. Thomas et. al. (2003) estimate a 20 per cent increase in income for population aged 30-70 years when an intervention providing iron supplements is implemented. Baird. Et. al (2011) in case of Kenya estimate 20 per cent increase in earnings due to implementation of Primary School Deworming Program.

There are very few India specific studies which study the impact on income. A few studies do measure the association of Childhood HAZ with future income and find that a 1 per cent increase in HAZ at age 2 is associated with 18-27 per cent more assets in India at adulthood (Sachdev et al. 2005; Bhargava et al, 2005). Then there are studies which link reduced stunting with higher education which in turn reflects better earning potential of the individual (Nandi et al , 2016). For Andhra Pradesh, Boone et. al. (2017) show that a package of interventions addressing health knowledge and health seeking behaviour, buttressing existing health services, lead to significant reduction in neo-natal mortality.

Description of Interventions

India's policy framework contains a number of nutrition intervention strategies. Coalition for Food and Nutrition Security in India (2010) has played a major role in recommending most of these strategies to control malnutrition and ensure food security. Menon et. al (2016) present a comprehensive analysis of the cost of delivering these interventions and computed unit cost from the actual program. The figures are available for the most recent periods. We have considered a subset of the sub components of these interventions given our target

population which include pregnant women, lactating mothers and children below the age of 5 years. Details of the specific interventions along with the target group and source are presented in the following table. We have used the unit cost data for the cost-benefit exercise. The cost for micronutrients such as calcium supplements and multi-micronutrients have been obtained from the finances of National Health Mission.

Table 3: Details of Nutrition based interventions within India’s Policy framework (Menon et. al. 2016)

Component	Intervention population	Unit Cost, India (USD)	Unit Cost, India in Rupees	Marginal cost of Mothers time (own calculation) in USD	Marginal cost of Mothers time in Rupees
Counseling during pregnancy	Pregnant women	1.76	114	0.56	36
Counselling for optimal breastfeeding	Caregivers of children 0– 6 months of age	1.67	109	2.09	136
Complementary feeding and hand washing education	Caregivers of children 6– 12 months of age	7.47	486	1.83	119
Complementary feeding and hand washing education	Caregivers of children 12-24 months of age	2.8	182	1.68	109
Complementary food supplements	Children 6-12 months	15.16	985	16.48	1071
Complementary food supplements	Children 12-36 months	30.31	1970	65.91	4284
Supplementary food rations	Pregnant and lactating women	17.67	1149	24.72	1607
Calcium supplements	Pregnant women and lactating mothers	14.16	920	0	0
MMN supplement	Pregnant women and lactating mothers	7.92	515	0	0
Community based treatment of SAM (CMAM)	Children under 5 suffering from SAM	69.23 - 178.22	4,500 - 11,584	12.11	787
TOTAL ex. CMAM		98.92	6429.8		

Source: Menon et. al. 2016, Cost for MMN and CA from NHM. Cost for CMAM based on an phase 1 and phase 2 unit costs for POSHAN project in Rajasthan.

Calculation of Costs and Benefits

The effect of nutrition interventions on stunting is well documented in literature as discussed earlier. We calculate the benefits in terms of increase in productivity, and the number of cases of mortality and morbidity avoided due to reduction in stunting. Data for stunting (below 2SD and below 3SD) has been obtained for National Family Health Survey (NFHS 4). For calculating productivity benefits, stunting (below 2SD) figures from National Family Health Survey (NFHS-4) have been used. Five alternate scenarios have been created on the basis of specific nutrition based interventions for the cost benefit analysis. The details are presented in the following table:

Table 4: Scenario based on specific components of nutrition intervention

Scenario	Nutrition based intervention	Components included
1	Direct nutrition based interventions	All components
2	Interpersonal counselling for behaviour change	Counseling during pregnancy, Counselling for optimal breastfeeding and Complementary feeding and hand washing education
3	Supplementary food for mother and child	Complementary food supplements, Supplementary food rations, Additional food rations, Facility-based treatment and Cash transfers.
4	Micronutrient supplementation for pregnant women during ANC visits	Vitamin A supplementation, ORS and therapeutic zinc supplements for treatment of diarrhea, Deworming, Iron supplements and IFA supplements.
5	Community based treatment of children with SAM using RUTF	Additional food rations (RUTF) for Severely malnourished (WAZ<3) Children and Community-based treatment

Lifetime productivity benefits have been computed assuming that the interventions would reduce stunting by 12 - 20 per cent (Bhutta et al. 2013). Following Hoddinott (2011), a reduction of 66 per cent in per capita income in adulthood has been assumed. Net present value of the benefits due to reduction in stunting has been computed assuming that the child will work till 54 years. The assumptions regarding the effectiveness of intervention of stunting and per capita income for different scenarios are based on evidences documented in literature. The following table describes the assumptions:

Table 5: Assumption regarding wages and effectiveness of specific components of nutrition intervention

Scenario	Nutrition based intervention	Wage Effects	Effectiveness of intervention
1	Direct nutrition based interventions	66 per cent	20 per cent reduction in stunting
2	Interpersonal counselling for behaviour change	66 per cent	12 per cent reduction in stunting
3	Supplementary food for mother and child	66 per cent	18 per cent reduction in stunting
4	Micronutrient supplementation for pregnant women during ANC visits	7.5 per cent	17 per cent reduction in low birth weight

The per capita income of Andhra Pradesh has been projected till 2070. Observing the economic performance, we are assuming that the real wage will grow at a rate of 6-7 per cent initially and around 3-4 per cent for the period after 20 years from now. The exchange rate has been assumed to be at Rs 65 per USD. Discount rates of 3 per cent, 5 per cent and 8 per cent have been used to calculate the net present value of costs and benefits.

Methodology

Methodology: Overall, Promotion and Provision Package

To initiate the analysis, we consider the intervention is targeted at the pregnant mothers in 2016 and the cohort of children born in 2017. The assumptions for the effectiveness of the specific intervention are same as in table 5. Three mutually exclusive classes of stunting have been considered: severe, moderate and none. The risk reduction factor for various diseases such as Diarrhea, ALRI, Measles, Malaria and other infectious have been obtained from Olofin (2013) and are presented below.

Table 6: Hazard ratio (HR) estimates for specific causes of mortality, WHO 2006 standards Olofin et al 2013

Stunting/Hazard ratio	Diarrhea	ALRI	Measles	Malaria	Other infectious
Severe	6.33	6.39	6.01	1.92	3.01
Moderate	2.38	2.18	2.79	1.06	1.86
None	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00	1.00

Methodology: Micronutrient supplementation for pregnant women during ANC visits

The methodology for evaluating the benefits arising from implementation of micronutrients intervention is slightly different. Here the analysis has been performed for a single year, 2018. The estimated benefits from provision of micronutrients include reduction in mortality and morbidity related with anaemia, low birth weight, pre-eclampsia and pre-term birth (presented in appendix). The reduction in relative risk from provision of appropriate micronutrients are presented in table 7 below.

Table 7: Risk reduction factor associated with conditions arising from micronutrient deficiency

	Source	RR factor
IDA with MMN	Peña-Rosas et. al., 2015	0.34
LBW (MMN vs. IFA)	Haider & Bhutta, 2015	0.88
LBW (IFA vs placebo)	Peña-Rosas et. al., 2015	0.84
Maternal death (Ca vs. placebo)	Hofmeyr et. al., 2010	0.80
Preterm birth	Hofmeyr et. al., 2014	0.76

The cost of implementing this intervention will be 88 crore rupees per year. A break-up of cost is provided in the table below. The infrastructure is already in place and the major part of the cost will be incurred for provision of the micronutrient and calcium supplements during ANC visits that women are undertaking normally. It is being assumed that during each visit a two month supply of Calcium and Multi-micronutrients will be provided to the beneficiary. The cost for health workers have been calculated by making modest assumptions about the caseload per worker, number of additional health workers and supervisors required. The scale-up cost which is the cost for scaling up the intervention includes the cost incurred on planning and co-ordination, behavioural change communication and training to health workers.

Table 8: Break up of cost, Micronutrient supplementation for pregnant women during ANC visits, Andhra Pradesh

Components	Cost in rupees	Cost in USD	Percentage
Total cost of supplements (Rupees)	8571,33,921	131,86,676	0.973
Health worker costs (Rupees)	197,14,692	3,03,303	0.022
Total training and scale up costs (Rupees)	36,45,000	56,077	0.004
Total cost (Rupees)	88,04,93,613	135,46,056	

Methodology: Community based treatment of children with SAM using RUTF (CMAM)

To estimate the benefits from community based treatment of SAM the risk reduction factor associated with wasting for various diseases have been used from Olofin et. al. (2013).

Table 9: Hazard ratio (HR) estimates for specific causes of mortality related with wasting, WHO 2006 standards Olofin et al 2013

	Diarrhea	Respiratory Tract Infection	Measles	Malaria	Other infectious diseases
SAM	12.33	9.68	9.63	1.24	11.21
None	1	1	1	1	1

The intervention assumes a scale up of a community-based program that will actively screen and treat 50% of all children suffering from SAM using RUTF. Costs and benefits are estimated for a single year, 2018. Due to the limited evidence of this intervention in the Indian context, a plausible range of benefits and costs is presented.

Burza et al. (2015) document the results of a CMAM program in Bihar that treated 8,274 children for SAM between February 2009 and September 2011. The results indicate that of the children who had been identified and for whom the treatment had been initiated, 0.8 per cent died during treatment, 36.2 per cent defaulted during treatment, 5.6 per cent did not respond to treatment and the remaining 57.4 per cent completed treatment and recovered. Following this, we assume a low end effectiveness rate of 57 per cent from CMAM. In contrast, initial results from the POSHAN pilot in Rajasthan suggest 9 month recovery rates of 90 per cent (Chief Minister’s Office of Rajasthan, 2017). This is assumed to be the high end value.

The costs for treatment of SAM and MAM include the cost of providing RUTF, recruitment of additional personnel, training and supervision of the health workers, incentives for staff and parents as well as cost incurred by households for treatment. Costs of POSHAN phase 1 are Rs 11,584 per child (Results 4 Development commissioned by NHM, n.d.), while the costs of POSHAN phase 2 have been estimated at Rs. 4500 per child (Srinivasan, 2017). Modest household costs for seven half-day follow up visits are estimated at Rs. 787 per child based on data from NSS71 and following standard assumptions of *Andhra Pradesh Priorities* project for valuing time. Taken together this suggests low end costs of Rs. 5287 per child, and a high end cost of Rs. 12,371 per child treated.

Intervention Effectiveness and Calculation of Health Effects

The reduction in stunting and wasting arising from the interventions is presented in tables below. The target group are the mothers who are pregnant in 2016, and the subsequent cohort of children born in 2017. The reduction in stunting is based on Bhutta et al (2013) (refer tables in previous section for reduction factor). For wasting we assume a low end effectiveness of 57%, a high end effectiveness of 90%, and median scenario of the two. Treatment of those with moderate acute malnutrition is not included in the intervention.

Table 10a: Pre and post prevalence of stunting, Andhra Pradesh

	Pre-intervention prevalence of stunting	Intervention effectiveness	Post- intervention prevalence of stunting
Direct nutrition based interventions			
Severe	10.7	-20.3	8.5
Moderate	20.7	-20.3	16.5
None	68.6		75.0
Interpersonal counselling for behaviour change			
Severe	10.7	-12.0	9.4
Moderate	20.7	-12.0	18.2
None	68.6		72.4
Supplementary food for mother and child			
Severe	10.7	-18.0	8.8
Moderate	20.7	-18.0	17.0
None	68.6		74.3

Table 10b: Pre and post prevalence of wasting, Andhra Pradesh

	Pre-intervention prevalence of wasting	Intervention effectiveness	Coverage (assumed)	Post-intervention prevalence of wasting
Community based treatment of SAM using RUTF - low				
Severe	4.5	-57.0	50%	3.2
Moderate	12.7			12.7
None	82.8			84.1
Community based treatment of SAM using RUTF - high				
Severe	4.5	-90.0	50%	2.5
Moderate	12.7			12.7
None	82.8			84.8
Community based treatment of SAM using RUTF - median				
Severe	4.5	-73.5	50%	2.8
Moderate	12.7			12.7
None	82.8			84.5

The number of deaths due to disease related causes and the associated morbidity among children aged less than 1 year and 1-4 years has been calculated using the data from Global

Burden of Diseases 2016. The effectiveness of nutrition interventions for diseases under different scenario is presented on the basis of available evidence.

The data for annual deaths for the first year of life of the child (2017) is given separately but the data for age group 1-4 group is available in aggregate form. Therefore, to estimate the annual benefits in terms of reduction in YLLs and YLDs we assume they are split equally across these years starting from 2018 to 2021.

Common Approach

The number of deaths and Years Lost due to Morbidity (YLDs) avoided have been calculated using the risk factor and the effectiveness of the intervention which lead to a change in the distribution of stunting or wasting. The potential impact fraction is defined as:

$$PIF_j = \left(\sum_{i=1}^n P_i RR_{ji} - \sum_{i=1}^n P'_i RR_{ji} \right) / \sum_{i=1}^n P_i RR_{ji}$$

Where RR_{ji} is the relative risk associated with cause due to specific disease (denoted by j) for each category of stunting or wasting (denoted by i). Change in deaths and YLDs could be given by

$$M = \sum_{i=1}^n PIF_j D_j$$

Where D_j could be defined as either deaths due to specific cause or total Years Lost due to Morbidity (YLDs). These figures have been computed using GBD 2016 data.

Two approaches have been used to calculate the mortality benefits.

Approach 1: In this approach the risk factor and potential impact fraction are first used to compute total number of deaths avoided which are then converted to YLLs avoided using the

life table. The discounted values of these YLLs are 3 times the value of per capita SDP as per guidelines of *Andhra Pradesh Priorities* project.

Burza et al (2015) document that 14% of children relapse in SAM. Thus for the cost-benefit analysis of CMAM, we assume for 86% of the deaths avoided, the full discounted lifetime YLLs are avoided, while for 14% of cases, only one quarter of YLL is avoided.

Approach 2: The monetary benefits using the central value of statistical life have been computed. The central estimate of statistical life for Andhra Pradesh have been assumed to be Rs. 8,893,447 or \$1,36,822.

For morbidity avoided, the numbers of YLDs avoided have been valued at three times the per capita SDP.

Results

Table 11 presents the Deaths avoided and Years lost to Disability (YLDs) avoided per 1000 children in 2017 birth cohort reached by the intervention in Andhra Pradesh. The highest impact of the intervention will be to reduce the number of deaths arising because of diarrhea.

Table 11: Deaths avoided and Years lost to Disability (YLDs) avoided per 1000 children in 2017 birth cohort reached by the intervention, Andhra Pradesh

	Diarrhea	ALRI	Measles	Malaria	Other infectious	Total
Deaths avoided						
Direct nutrition based interventions	0.38	0.89	0.1	0.09	0.22	1.67
Interpersonal counselling for behaviour change	0.22	0.53	0.06	0.05	0.13	0.99
Supplementary food for mother and child	0.33	0.79	0.08	0.08	0.19	1.48
YLDs avoided						
Direct nutrition based interventions	0.85	0.08	0.03	0.02	0.16	1.14
Interpersonal counselling for behaviour change	0.5	0.05	0.02	0.01	0.1	0.67
Supplementary food for mother and child	0.75	0.07	0.03	0.02	0.14	1.01

Table 12: Avoided mortality and morbidity benefit per child based on two valuation approaches for mortality and a single approach for morbidity (all values in Rs)

Intervention	Discount Rate	Mortality avoided benefits (approach 1)	Mortality avoided benefits (approach 2)	Morbidity avoided Benefits	Productivity benefit
Direct nutrition based interventions	3%	13,300	18,116	423	227,163
	5%	12,428	11,209	408	107,988
	8%	11,254	6,502	389	39,176
Interpersonal counselling for behaviour change	3%	7,862	10,709	250	134,283
	5%	7,346	6,626	241	63,835
	8%	6,652	3,844	230	23,158
Supplementary food for mother and child	3%	11,793	16,063	375	201,425
	5%	11,020	9,939	362	95,753
	8%	9,979	5,765	345	34,737

Table 12 presents the avoided mortality and morbidity benefits per child. The results indicate that the mortality benefits lie in a range of Rs. 4,000 to 18,000. The productivity benefits dominate the benefits, and are as high as 227,000 at 3 per cent discount rate for direct nutrition based interventions. The value of productivity benefits is significantly smaller at lower discount rates.

Table 13 presents the avoided mortality and morbidity benefits from provision of micronutrient and calcium supplementation. There are a multitude of impacts from the intervention: 106,882 cases of maternal anemia avoided, 25,293 avoided LBW babies, 113 avoided maternal deaths, 19,103 avoided preterm births, 1,337 avoided preterm deaths and 210 avoided still births. The total YLDs avoided from all effects is 54,199 at the 5% discount rate with almost all from LBW averted. Total YLLs avoided from 1660 avoided deaths and still births are 31,797 at the 5% discount rate.

Table 13: Avoided mortality and morbidity benefit from provision of micronutrient supplementation for pregnant women during ANC visits, Andhra Pradesh

Benefits	3 per cent	5 per cent	8 per cent
YLDs due to cases of anemia averted (maternal disabilities)	2,250	2,235	2,213
YLDs due to cases of LBW averted (children)	78,107	51,923	33,380
YLDs avoided due to preterm birth avoided	61	41	26
Total YLDs avoided	80,419	54,199	35,619
YLLs avoided due to deaths avoided due to improved birth outcomes	6,060	4,046	2,610
YLLs avoided due to maternal deaths avoided from pre-eclampsia reduction	2,702	1,977	1,357
YLLs avoided from child deaths avoided due to preterm reduction	38,600	25,774	16,626
Total YLLs avoided	47,362	31,797	20,592
Total earnings saved (Rs)	9983,07,042	4504,19,986	1548,05,860

Table 14 presents the number of deaths and YLDs avoided from the community based management of SAM, each year. The intervention would save between 424 and 664 lives each year, mostly from avoided deaths due to diarrhea and respiratory infections. It would also avoid 749 to 1175 YLDs per year, mostly from avoided diarrhea and other infections.

Table 14: Under-5 mortality and morbidity avoided from CMAM (50% coverage) per year

	Diarrhea	ALRI	Measles	Malaria	Other infectious	Total
Deaths avoided						
Low effectiveness of CMAM	111	198	25	1	88	424
High effectiveness of CMAM	174	311	39	2	139	664
Median effectiveness	143	254	32	1	114	544
YLDs avoided						
Low effectiveness of CMAM	562	40	18	1	129	749
High effectiveness of CMAM	882	62	27	1	202	1175
Median effectiveness	722	51	23	1	166	962

Table 15 provides the BCRs for various scenarios of benefits and costs. The results indicate that BCRs for this intervention range between 2.0 and 7.5 depending on assumptions used. While variation is significant, it seems that the benefits-to-costs of SAM treatment are

unlikely to be higher than any of the other, preventative nutrition interventions examined in this study.

Table 15: Summary of Benefit-Cost Ratios from various CMAM scenarios (approach 1, 5% discount rate)

	High Costs (Rs. 12,371 per child treated)	Median Costs (Rs. 8,829 per child treated)	Low Costs (Rs. 5,287 per child treated)
High Benefits (Rs. 39,716 per child treated)	3.2	4.5	7.5
Median Benefits (Rs. 32,523 per child treated)	2.6	3.7	6.2
Low Benefits (Rs. 25,330 per child treated)	2.0	2.9	4.8

Conclusion

Although, the nutrition indicators of Andhra Pradesh are better than the national average, there is much scope for improvement. A cost-benefit analysis of the nutrition interventions in India's policy framework presented in this paper has shown that there are sizeable benefits to be reaped. Many of the diseases and morbidities which arise because of malnutrition can be avoided by provision of nutrition supplements. The programs and interventions are already in place in India. It can be safely concluded that expansion of programs and identification of the target population will benefit the economy in the long run.

Table 16 below summarizes the main results using approach 1 for valuing mortality benefits. This base case includes the benefits arising from increase in productivity and from avoiding mortalities and morbidities. The overall package is expected to reduce stunting by 20 per cent. The prevalence of severe stunting will reduce from 10.7% to 8.5% and moderate stunting from 20.7% to 16.5%. The cost of overall package per individual is Rs. 12,885 and benefits are Rs. 108,000 resulting in a benefit cost ratio of 9. The highest benefits accrue from implementation of promotion intervention. The benefit-cost ratio in case of promotion (61), provision (10), micronutrients (39) and community based treatment of SAM (4) are also significant.

The results from sensitivity analysis (approach 2) are similar to the primary analysis. Here, the benefit-cost ratio in case of promotion, provision and overall package are 9, 60 and 10 respectively. For micronutrients it is 42 and for CMAM it is 5 (median scenario).

The coverage of nutrition-based interventions for mothers is not the problem, but the low utilization poses a challenge. On the other hand, the interventions for children need to be scaled up (Mani et. al., 2017). The agencies of Central and State governments have to understand the problems which exist in the local settings and then develop a more comprehensive and robust mechanism accordingly. They have to demonstrate better governance, too. The experience of districts which have performed better can be used and similar models can be replicated. Promotion of timely and appropriate complementary feeding practices can improve the health outcomes. The involvement of communities in a responsible manner can overcome the problem due to shortage of health workers. In particular, attention needs to be paid on identifying the vulnerable population and strengthening the referral system to prevent episode of diseases which could easily be avoided (Mani et. al ,2017). Andhra Pradesh has definitely been proactively working in this direction, hopefully, the recently launched Nutrition Mission will be instrumental in closing the present gaps which prevent the end of malnutrition.

Table 16: Results Approach 1 (primary analysis – years of life saved valued at 3x GSDP per capita)

Interventions	Benefit	Cost	BCR
Direct nutrition based interventions	120,824	12,885	9
Interpersonal counselling for behaviour change	71,423	1,177	61
Supplementary food for mother and child	107,135	10,341	10
Micronutrient supplementation for pregnant women during ANC visits	34,678	884	39
Community based treatment of SAM using RUTF (median)	32,523	8829	4

Table 17: Results Approach 2 (sensitivity analysis – lives saved valued at VSL)

Interventions	Benefit	Cost	BCR
Direct nutrition based interventions	119,606	12,885	9
Interpersonal counselling for behaviour change	70,703	1,177	60
Supplementary food for mother and child	106,054	10,341	10
Micronutrient supplementation for pregnant women during ANC visits	36,851	884	42
Community based treatment of SAM using RUTF (median)	45,452	8,829	5

All costs and benefits are in Rs per beneficiary, and assumes 5% discount rate

References

Avula R., Kadiyala S., Singh K. and Menon P. (2013) The Operational Evidence Base for Delivering Direct Nutrition Interventions in India: A Desk Review. IFPRI Discussion Paper 01299.

Awofeso, N. and Rammohan, A. (2011). Three Decades of the Integrated Child Development Services Program in India: Progress and Problems, Health Management - Different Approaches and Solutions, Dr. Krzysztof Smigorski (Ed.), ISBN: 978-953-307-296-8,

Baird S., Hicks J.H., Kremer M. and Miguel E. Worms at work: long-run impacts of child health gains. Berkeley: University of California at Berkeley; 2011.

Behrman J., Alderman H. and Hoddinott J. (2004). Hunger and Malnutrition. In: Global Crisis, Global Solutions (ed. B. Lomborg), pp 363–442. Cambridge University Press: Cambridge, UK.

Behrman, Jere R., John Hoddinott, John A. Maluccio, Erica Soler-Hampejsek, Emily L. Behrman, Reynaldo Martorell, Manuel Ramirez-Zea, and Aryeh D. Stein. (2006). What Determines Adult Cognitive Skills? Impacts of Pre-Schooling, Schooling and Post-Schooling Experiences in Guatemala. PSC Working Paper Series PSC 06-03

Bhandari R. and Sinha A.K. (2015). Public Investment on Food and Nutrition for Socially Excluded and Marginalised Groups and Directions for Public Policy and Public Finance. FLAIR Policy Paper 5. Accessed at https://flairindia.org/pdf/FLAIR_Policy_Paper%205_Public_Policy_and_Public_Finance_Malnutrition_and_Social_Exclusion_March%202015.pdf.

Bhargava SK, Sachdev HS, Fall CH, 2004, Relation of serial changes in childhood body-mass index to impaired glucose tolerance in young adulthood, New England Journal of Medicine, 2004;350:865–875.

Bhutta, Z.A., Ahmed, T., Black, R.E., Cousens, S., Dewey, K., Giugliani, E., Haider B.A., Kirkwood, B., Morris, S., Sachdev, H.P.S., and Shekar, M. (2008). What works? Interventions for maternal and child undernutrition and survival. *Lancet*; published online Jan 17. DOI: 10.1016/S0140-6736(07)61693-6.

Bhutta Z.A., Das J.K., Rizvi A., Gaffey M.F., Walker N. and Horton S. (2013a) Evidence-based interventions for improvement of maternal and child nutrition: what can be done and at what cost? *Lancet* 382, 452–477.

Branca F. and Ferrari M. (2002). Impact of micronutrient deficiencies on growth: the stunting syndrome." *Annals of Nutrition and Metabolism*, 46, 8:17.

Burza S, Mahajan R, Marino E, Sunyoto T, Shandilya C, Tabrez M (2015). Community-based management of severe acute malnutrition in India: new evidence from Bihar1–3. *Am J Clin Nutr.*;101:847-59.

Caulfield LE, Richard SA, Rivera JA, Musgrove P, Black RE. Stunting, wasting, and micronutrient deficiency disorders. 2nd ed. In: Jamison DT, Breman JG, Measham AR, Alleyne G, Claeson M, Evans DB, et al., editors. *Disease Control Priorities in Developing Countries*. Washington, DC: World Bank (2006). p. 551–68.

Chief Minister's Office of Rajasthan (2017), POSHAN: A Rajasthan government initiative to take care of children suffering from severe acute malnutrition, available at: <http://cmapp.rajasthan.gov.in/cmapp/frontend/frontmediacoveragedetails/poshan:-a-rajasthan-government-initiative-to-take-care-of-children-suffering-from-severe-acute-malnutrition.html>

CIFF (2018), TREATING ACUTELY MALNOURISHED CHILDREN IN RAJASTHAN (POSHAN), Available at: <https://ciff.org/grant-portfolio/treating-acutely-malnourished-children-rajasthan/>

Corsi DJ, Mejía-Guevara I, Subramanian SV (2016). Risk factors for chronic undernutrition among children in India: estimating relative importance, population attributable risk and fractions. *Social Science and Medicine* ;157:165-85

Global Burden of Disease (2016), IHME, University of Washington.

Government of Rajasthan (2018), POSHAN, Available at: <http://nrhmrajasthan.nic.in/POSHAN.htm>

Haider BA and Bhutta ZA (2015). Multiple-micronutrient supplementation for women during pregnancy. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*; 4.

Halim N, Spielman K and Larson B (2015). The economic consequences of selected maternal and early childhood nutrition interventions in low- and middle-income countries: a review of the literature, 2000-2013. *BMC Womens Health.*; 15:33. PMID: 25887257.

Hoddinott J., Maluccio J., Behrman JR., Martorell P, Melgar A.R. and Quisumbing M. (2011). The consequences of early childhood growth failure over the life course. Discussion Paper 1073, International Food Policy Research Institute: Washington, DC

Hoddinott J, Maluccio JA, Behrman JR and Martorell R, (2008). Effect of a nutrition intervention during early childhood on economic productivity in Guatemalan adults, *Lancet*, 371(9610):411-6.

Hofmeyr, GJ, Lawrie, TA, Atallah, AN, and Duley, L (2010). Calcium supplementation during pregnancy for preventing hypertensive disorders and related problems. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*; 8.

Hofmeyr GJ, Lawrie TA, Atallah AN, Duley L, Torloni MR (2014). Calcium supplementation during pregnancy for preventing hypertensive disorders and related problems. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev* ; 6(6).

Horton S., Shekar M., McDonald C., Mahal A. and Brooks J.K. (2010) *Scaling Up Nutrition – What Will It Cost?* The World Bank: Washington, D.C.

IIPS (International Institute for Population Sciences) and Macro International. 2007. *National Family Health Survey (NFHS-3), 2005–06: India: Key Findings*. Mumbai: IIPS.

Jacob, K.S. 2011. For a New Improved NRHM, in *The Hindu*, 7 August.

Mani, S, Nguyen, PH.; Avula, R.; Tran, LM.; and Menon, P. (2017). Improving nutrition in Andhra Pradesh: Insights from the current status of outcomes, determinants and interventions in 2016. *POSHAN Policy Note 10*. New Delhi, India: International Food Policy Research Institute. <http://ebrary.ifpri.org/cdm/ref/collection/p15738coll2/id/131517>

Menon P., McDonald C.M. & Chakrabarti S. (2015) Estimating the cost of delivering direct nutrition interventions at scale: national and subnational Level insights from India Maternal and Child Nutrition. 12(Suppl. 1): 169–185.

Ministry of Women and Child Development (2012). Strengthening and Restructuring of Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS) Scheme.

Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (2011), Operational guidelines on facility based management of children with severe acute malnutrition, New Delhi. Available at: (<http://www.cmamforum.org/Pool/Resources/Operational-guidelines-onfacility-based-management-of-children-with-severe-acutemalnutrition-India-2011.pdf>).

Ministry of Health and Family Welfare (2012) Project Implementation Plan for National Rural Health Mission, New Delhi.

Ministry of Women and Child Development (2012), Report of the Working Group on Nutrition for Twelfth Five Year Plan.

Nandi A, Ashok A, Kinra S, Behrman JR, and Laxminarayan R, 2016, Early Childhood Nutrition Is Positively Associated with Adolescent Educational Outcomes: Evidence from the Andhra Pradesh Child and Parents Study (APCAPS), Journal of Nutrition, jn223198

National Family Health Survey-4 indicates a reduction in malnourished children in the country: Smt Maneka Sanjay Gandhi, Press Information Bureau, Ministry of Women and Child Development, 17 March 2017.

National Family Health Survey-4 India Fact Sheet (2015-16).

Olofin I, McDonald CM, Ezzati M, Flaxman S and Black RE (2013). Associations of Suboptimal Growth with All-Cause and Cause-Specific Mortality in Children under Five Years: A Pooled Analysis of Ten Prospective Studies. *PLoS ONE* 8(5): e64636. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0064636.

Pena-Rosas JP, De-Regil LM, Gomez Malave H, Flores-Urrutia MC, Dowswell T (2015). Intermittent oral iron supplementation during pregnancy. *Cochrane Database Syst Rev*;7.

Reinhardt K, Fanzo J. Addressing chronic malnutrition through multiSectoral, sustainable approaches: a review of the causes and consequences. *Front Nutr.* 2014;1:13

Results 4 Development, commissioned by NHM, 'CMAM-Programme / Implementation Brief', Available at: <http://napiindia.in/docs/C-MAM-Project-Implementation-Brief.pdf>

Sachdev HS, Fall CH, Osmond C., 2005, Anthropometric indicators of body composition in young adults: relation to size at birth and serial measurements of body mass index in childhood in the New Delhi birth cohort. *American Journal of Clinical Nutrition.* 2005;82:456–466

Salomon, Joshua A., Juanita A. Haagsma, Adrian Davis, Charline Maertens de Noordhout, Suzanne Polinder, Arie H. Havelaar, Alessandro Cassini, Brecht Devleesschauwer, Mirjam Kretzschmar, Niko Speybroeck, Christopher J. L.

Sharma, AK (2017): "The National Rural Health Mission: A Critique," *Sociological Bulletin*, Vol 63, No 2, pp 287-30. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0038022920140206>

Srinivasan, P. 2017, 'Second round of malnutrition fight to cover 17,000 kids in Rajasthan', *Hindustan Times*, 22 Sep 2017, available at: <https://www.hindustantimes.com/jaipur/second-round-of-malnutrition-fight-to-cover-17-000-kids-in-rajasthan/story-Hc5eq03KJ4trYArNw964GO.html>

Murray, and Theo Vos. 2015. "Disability Weights for the Global Burden of Disease 2013 Study." *The Lancet Global Health* 3, no. 11: e712-e723.

The Coalition for Sustainable Nutrition Security (2010) Sustainable nutrition security in India: a leadership agenda for action. Available at: <http://www.intrahealth.org/files/media/vistaarpublications/LeadershipAgendaforAction>.

Thomas D, Frankenberg E, Friedman J, Habicht J-P, Hakimi M, Jones N, et al. Iron deficiency and the well-being of older adults: Early results from a randomized nutrition intervention. Mimeo: University of California, Los Angeles; 2003.

World Bank. India, Undernourished children: A call for reform and action (2005).

Appendix

Table 18: A list of programmes and schemes for children aged 0-3 years, 3-6 years and pregnant/lactating women.

Target Population	Programme
Pregnant and Lactating Women	Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS) Reproductive and Child Health II (RCH-II) National Rural Health Mission (NRHM) Reproductive, maternal, newborn child and adolescent health (RMNCH+A)
Children 0 – 3 years	Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS) Reproductive and Child Health II (RCH-II) National Rural Health Mission (NRHM) Reproductive, maternal, newborn child and adolescent health (RMNCH+A) Integrated Management of Neonatal and Childhood Illness (IMNCI) Rajiv Gandhi National Creche Scheme
Children 3 – 6 years	Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS) Reproductive and Child Health II (RCH-II) National Rural Health Mission (NRHM) Reproductive, maternal, newborn child and adolescent health (RMNCH+A) Rajiv Gandhi National Creche Scheme
Covering entire population	National Iodine Deficiency Disorders Control Programme (NIDDCP)

Source: The Coalition for Sustainable Nutrition Security (2010)

**Table 19: Deaths avoided per 1000 children in 2017 birth cohort reached by the intervention
(Direct nutrition based interventions)**

Year	Diarrhea	ALRI	Measles	Malaria	Other infectious	Total
2017	0.12	0.29		0.03	0.03	0.55
2018	0.06	0.15		0.02	0.02	0.28
2019	0.06	0.15		0.02	0.02	0.28
2020	0.06	0.15		0.02	0.02	0.28
2021	0.06	0.15		0.02	0.02	0.28
Total per cause	0.38	0.89		0.10	0.09	1.67

**Table 20: Deaths avoided per 1000 children in 2017 birth cohort reached by the intervention
(Interpersonal counselling for behaviour change)**

Year	Diarrhea	ALRI	Measles	Malaria	Other infectious	Total
2017	0.07	0.17		0.02	0.02	0.32
2018	0.04	0.09		0.01	0.01	0.17
2019	0.04	0.09		0.01	0.01	0.17
2020	0.04	0.09		0.01	0.01	0.17
2021	0.04	0.09		0.01	0.01	0.17
Total per cause	0.22	0.53		0.06	0.05	0.99

**Table 21: Deaths avoided per 1000 children in 2017 birth cohort reached by the intervention
(Supplementary food for mother and child)**

Year	Diarrhea	ALRI	Measles	Malaria	Other infectious	Total
2017	0.11	0.26		0.03	0.03	0.48
2018	0.06	0.13		0.01	0.01	0.25
2019	0.06	0.13		0.01	0.01	0.25
2020	0.06	0.13		0.01	0.01	0.25
2021	0.06	0.13		0.01	0.01	0.25
Total per cause	0.33	0.79		0.08	0.08	1.48

Table 22: Years lost to Disability (YLDs) avoided per 1000 children in 2017 birth cohort reached by the intervention (Direct nutrition based interventions)

Year	Diarrhea	ALRI	Measles	Malaria	Other infectious	Total
2017	0.59	0.06	0.02	0.02	0.11	0.80
2018	0.06	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.09
2019	0.06	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.09
2020	0.06	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.09
2021	0.06	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.09
Total per cause	0.85	0.08	0.03	0.02	0.16	1.14

Table 23: Years lost to Disability (YLDs) avoided per 1000 children in 2017 birth cohort reached by the intervention (Interpersonal counselling for behaviour change)

Year	Diarrhea	ALRI	Measles	Malaria	Other infectious	Total
2017	0.35	0.03	0.01	0.01	0.07	0.47
2018	0.04	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.05
2019	0.04	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.05
2020	0.04	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.05
2021	0.04	0.00	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.05
Total per cause	0.50	0.05	0.02	0.01	0.10	0.67

Table 24: Years lost to Disability (YLDs) avoided per 1000 children in 2017 birth cohort reached by the intervention (Supplementary food for mother and child)

Year	Diarrhea	ALRI	Measles	Malaria	Other infectious	Total
2017	0.53	0.05	0.02	0.01	0.10	0.71
2018	0.06	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.08
2019	0.06	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.08
2020	0.06	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.08
2021	0.06	0.01	0.00	0.00	0.01	0.08
Total per cause	0.75	0.07	0.03	0.02	0.14	1.01

As a new state, Andhra Pradesh faces a bright future, but it is still experiencing many acute social and economic development challenges. It has made great strides in creating a positive environment for business, and was recently ranked 2nd in India for ease of doing business. Yet, progress needs to be much faster if it is to achieve its ambitions of becoming the leading state in India in terms of social development and economic growth. With limited resources and time, it is crucial that focus is informed by what will do the most good for each rupee spent. The Andhra Pradesh Priorities project as part of the larger India Consensus – a partnership between Tata Trusts and the Copenhagen Consensus Center, will work with stakeholders across the state to identify, analyze, rank and disseminate the best solutions for the state. We will engage people and institutions from all parts of society, through newspapers, radio and TV, along with NGOs, decision makers, sector experts and businesses to propose the most relevant solutions to these challenges. We will commission some of the best economists in India, Andhra Pradesh, and the world to calculate the social, environmental and economic costs and benefits of these proposals



ANDHRA PRADESH PRIORITIES

AN
INDIA CONSENSUS
PRIORITIZATION
PROJECT

For more information visit www.APpriorities.com

C O P E N H A G E N C O N S E N S U S C E N T E R

Copenhagen Consensus Center is a think tank that investigates and publishes the best policies and investment opportunities based on social good (measured in dollars, but also incorporating e.g. welfare, health and environmental protection) for every dollar spent. The Copenhagen Consensus was conceived to address a fundamental, but overlooked topic in international development: In a world with limited budgets and attention spans, we need to find effective ways to do the most good for the most people. The Copenhagen Consensus works with 300+ of the world's top economists including 7 Nobel Laureates to prioritize solutions to the world's biggest problems, on the basis of data and cost-benefit analysis.